Program Implementation Unit (PIU),
Planning & Development Board,
Government of the Punjab

EVALUATION REPORT

REQUEST FOR QUOTATIONS (RFQs)

HIRING OF INTERNAL AUDIT FIRM FOR PIU, P&D BOARD

1. PROGRAM BACKGROUND

Program Implementation Unit, Planning & Development Board is looking after the monitoring and coordination of multiple donor funded Programs and other initiatives including Strengthening Markets for Agricultural and Rural Transformation (SMART) Program, Pakistan Regulatory Modernization Initiative (PRMI), and Technical Assistance (TA) component Punjab Resource Improvement & Digital Effectiveness (PRIDE) Program, etc.

Program Implementation Unit, P&D Board under SMART program requires to hire Internal Audit firm to conduct the internal audit of PIU, P&D Board for the FY 2023-24. Since the estimated cost is **PKR=2.00 Million)**, therefore, the procurement is processed through Request For Quotations (RFQ) method in accordance with PPRA Rule No. 46-A as per approved procurement plan.

2. GENERAL

The Request for Quotation (RFQ) document was issued to different renowned consultancy firms 20.09.2024**.** Following interested firms participated in the procurement process:

i. M/s. Clarkson Hyde Saud Ansari
ii. M/s. EY Ford Rhodes
iii. M/s. A.F.Ferguson

3. SUBMISSION OF QUOTATIONS

The date and time for submission of quotation was fixed on **07.10.2024** at **11:00 A.M** and quotations from above mentioned three (03) firms were received on the fixed date and time:

4. QUOTATION OPENING

Bids were opened on **07.10.2024 at 11:30 A.M** in committee room of Program Implementation Unit, P&D Board by the procurement committee in presence of representatives of the firms who attended. The name of firms and their quoted prices were announced and recorded. Minutes of the quotation opening meeting is attached as **Appendix-1.** The detail is given as under;

Sr. #	Name of Firm	Bid Price as Read Out (Inclusive of taxes)
01	M/s. Clarkson Hyde Saud Ansari	Rs.1,600,000/-

02	M/s. EY Ford Rhodes	Rs. 4,100,000/-
03	M/s. A.F.Ferguson	Rs. 15,000,000/-

5. ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA

The procurement committee evaluated the quotation on the basis of following parameters as mentioned in the RFQ documents;

i. Legal status of firm (registration with ICAP etc).
ii. Registration with Federal Board of Revenue FBR (NTN Certificate)
iii. Firms should submit details of only 03 most related assignments of similar complexity and scale (in terms of size and cost) completed in public sector or donor funded projects in past with documentary evidence i.e contract agreement or their completion certificate issued by the concerned clients.
iv. At least, 05 years relevant experience of conducting audit under public and/or private sector projects or programs.
v. Availability of key team members (Profile/CV of key team may be attached)

6. ARITHMETIC CHECK AND CORRECTIONS

The quotations were checked for arithmetic corrections and corrections have been applied where required. The details of arithmetic corrected bids have been summarized as following:

Sr. #	Name of Firm	Bid Prices as Read Out inclusive of taxes (PKR)	Arithmetic Corrected Bid Prices (PKR)
01	M/s. Clarkson Hyde Saud Ansari	Rs.1,600,000/-	Rs.1,600,000/-
02	M/s. EY Ford Rhodes	Rs. 4,100,000/-	Rs. 4,100,000/-
03	M/s. A.F.Ferguson	Rs. 15,000,000/-	Rs. 15,000,000/-

7. ACCEPTANCE/ REJECTION OF THE QUOTATIONS

After detailed evaluation of eligibility and financial rates, the status of the firms is given as under: -

Sr. #	Name of Firm	Ranking	Status of the Firms
01	M/s. Clarkson Hyde Saud Ansari	1st	M/s. Clarkson Hyde Saud Ansari is lowest evaluated firm and recommended for award of contract.
02	M/s. EY Ford Rhodes	2nd	The firm quoted the price which is comparatively higher and rejected
03	M/s. A.F.Ferguson	3rd.	The firm quoted the price which is comparatively highest and rejected.

8. QUOTATION VALIDITY

The price validity period of 45 days from the date of bids opening was specified in the RFQ document.

9. TIME FOR COMPLETION

The firms agreed to complete the work within one month from the date of commencement of work as per RFQ document.

10. COMPLIANCE WITH ELIGIBILITY REQUIREMENTS

The firm's compliance has been reviewed with the requirements of RFQ document.

11. FINANCIAL COMPARATIVE STATEMENT

The quotation based on comparative statement is placed at **Appendix-2**

12. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS.

Based on the detailed evaluation, it is concluded that **M/s. Clarkson Hyde Saud Ansari** has submitted the lowest evaluated price of **Rs.1,600,000/- (inclusive of all applicable taxes).** Accordingly, it is recommended by the procurement committee that contract may issue to above mentioned selected firm after completion of 10 days' grievance period.

APPENDIX 1: QUOTATION OPENING RECORD

GOVERNMENT OF THE PUNJAB
PROGRAM IMPLEMENTATION UNIT
PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT BOARD

Subject**:** **MINUTES OF PROCUREMENT COMMITTEE MEETING FOR OPENING OF QUOTATIONS FOR INTERNAL AUDIT FOR STRENGTHENING MARKETS FOR AGRICULTURE AND RURAL TRANSFORMATION (SMART) PROGRAM**

(Date & Time: 07.10.2024 at 11:30 A.M)

A procurement committee meeting for opening of quotations was held under the chairmanship of Program Director, Program Implementation / Support Unit, Planning & Development Board on 07.10.2024 at 11:30 A.M for hiring of short term consultancy firm for internal audit under Program Implementation Unit, Planning & Development board. List of the Participants is attached at **Annex-A**.

2. The procurement committee showed all the sealed envelopes and opened the quotations and announced name of participated chartered accountant firms and their quoted prices as per detail given below;

Sr. No.	Name of Firms	Quoted Price as readout (Inclusive of all taxes) in PKR
01	M/s. Clarkson Hyde Saud Ansari CA	Rs.1,600,000/-
02	M/s.EY Ford Rhodes CA	Rs. 4,100,000/-
03	M/s. A.F.Ferguson CA	Rs. 15,000,000/-

Decisions:

i. The chair directed to prepare the detail evaluation report as per evaluation criteria defined in the RFQ document.

ii. Ten business days as grievance period shall be given to all participating firms before award of contract under PPRA Rules 2014.

3. During the procurement process there was no dispute found and no grievance raised from any firm till to-date.

4. The meeting ended by the chair with the vote of thanks.

GOVERNMENT OF THE PUNJAB
PROGRAM IMPLEMENTATION UNIT
PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT BOARD

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

(Date & Time: 07.10.2024 at 11:30 A.M)

Sr. No.	Name of Officer	Designation	Organization
01	Mr. Ali Jalal	Program Director	PIU, P&D Board
02	Mr. Waqar Hussain	Procurement Specialist	PIU, P&D Board
03	M. Ahmad Awan	Program Officer	PIU, P&D Board

APPENDIX-2

GOVERNMENT OF THE PUNJAB
PROGRAM IMPLEMENTATION UNIT
PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT BOARD

Subject**:** **MINUTES OF PROCUREMENT COMMITTEE MEETING FOR HIRING OF CONSULTANCY FIRM FOR INTERNAL AUDIT UNDER PROGRAM IMPLEMENTATION UNIT, PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT BOARD**

(Date & Time: 08.10.2024 at 11:00 A.M)

A procurement committee meeting for evaluation of quotations was held under the chairmanship of Program Director, Program Implementation Unit, Planning & Development Board on 08.10.2024 at 11:00 A.M for hiring of consultancy firm for internal audit under Program Implementation Unit, Planning & Development Board. List of the participants is attached at **Flag-A**.

2. It was briefed that procurement process for hiring of consultancy firm for internal audit was initiated by issuance of Request for Quotation (RFQs) to the renowned consultancy firms on 20.09.2024 as per PPRA Rule No. 46-A. Afterward, the procurement committee opened the sealed quotations of participated firms on 07.10.2024 at 11:30 AM in the presence of the representatives of the firms who attended.

3. Accordingly, the draft evaluation report was prepared as per qualification criteria mentioned in the RFQ document. Subsequently, the procurement committee reviewed the evaluation report and recommended for award of contract to M/s. Clarkson Hyde Saud Ansari for hiring of Internal Audit firm under Program Implementation Unit, Planning & Development Board at a total price of PKR=1,600,000/- (inclusive of all applicable taxes), evaluation report is placed at **Flag-B.**

Decisions:

- Procurement committee decided to upload the evaluation report on the website of PIU, P&D Board.
- Procurement committee decided that ten days shall be given as grievance period to all participated firms before award of purchase order to the selected firm.

4. During the procurement process there was no dispute found and no grievance was raised by any bidder till to-date.

5. The meeting ended by the chair with the vote of thanks.

==========

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

Subject**:** **MINUTES OF PROCUREMENT COMMITTEE MEETING FOR HIRING OF CONSULTANCY FIRM FOR INTERNAL AUDIT UNDER PROGRAM IMPLEMENTATION UNIT, PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT BOARD**

(Date & Time: 08.10.2024 at 11:00 A.M)

Sr. No.	Name of Officer	Designation	Organization
01	Mr. Ali Jalal	Program Director	PIU, P&D Board
02	Mr. Waqar Hussain	Procurement Specialist	PIU, P&D Board
03	Hafiz M. Ahmad Awan	Program Officer	PIU, P&D Board

FINANCIAL EVALUATION OF FIRMS FOR THE ASSIGNMENT OF INTERNAL AUDIT UNDER PROGRAM IMPLEMENTATION UNIT, PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT BOARD

Sr. #	Name of Firm	Ranking of the firms	Bid Prices as Read Out inclusive of taxes (PKR)	Arithmetic Corrected Bid Prices (PKR)
01	M/s. Clarkson Hyde Saud Ansari	1st	Rs.1,600,000/-	Rs.1,600,000/-
02	M/s. EY Ford Rhodes	2nd	Rs. 4,100,000/-	Rs. 4,100,000/-
03	M/s. A.F.Ferguson	3rd	Rs. 15,000,000/-	Rs. 15,000,000/-

Note: Procurement committee recommended for award of contract to M/s. Clarkson Hyde Saud Ansari & Co. at a total cost of Rs.1,600,000/- (inclusive taxes) being lowest evaluated firm.

Program Officer **Procurement Specialist** **Program Director**