
SHORTLISTING DOCUMENT

**Third Party Validation of Program Development Objectives (PDOs) and
Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) for Jobs & competitiveness (J&C)
Program**

and

**Strengthening Markets for Agriculture and Rural Transformation” (SMART)
Punjab Program**

**Under
Program Implementation Unit, P&D Board**



**Program Implementation Unit, Planning & Development Board
11-A, Upper Mall, Mian Meer Road, Near Hotel Crown Plaza
Lahore**

August, 2020

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Disclaimer.....	5
Section I: Instruction to Applicants	6
A. Scope of Application	6
B. Eligible Applicants.....	6
C. Number of EOIs.....	6
D.EOI Preparation Cost	6
E. Examination of Shortlisting Document	7
F. Right to Accept or Reject any or all Applications.....	7
G. Contents of Shortlisting Document	7
H. Clarifications	7
I. Amendment of Shortlisting Document.....	7
J. Language	7
K. Validity of EOIs	8
L. Format and Signing of EOI Application	8
M. Sealing and Marking of EOI Applications	8
N.EOI Application Due Date.....	8
O. Late EOI Applications.....	8
P. Modifications/ Substitution/ Withdrawal of EOIs.....	8
Q. Evaluation of EOI – Criteria	9
R. Evaluation of EOI - Supporting Documents	9
S. Evaluation of EOI - Right to Reject	9
T. Confidentiality	9
U. Tests of responsiveness.....	Error! Bookmark not defined.
V. Clarifications	9
X. Qualification and Notification	9
Section 2: Term of References (tors)	10
Third Party Validation of Program Development Objectives (PDOs) and Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) for Jobs and Competitiveness (J&C) Program	10
1. Project Introduction:.....	10
2. Scope of Work, Duties and Responsibilities:	10
3. Verification of the implementation of the Program Action Plan.....	17
Third Party Validation of Program Development Objectives (PDOs) and Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) for Strengthening Markets for Agriculture and Rural Transformation (SMART) in Punjab Program	18
1. Project Introduction	18
2. Scope of Work, Duties and Responsibilities	18
1. Verification of the achievements of the Program Key Results and Disbursement Linked Indicators.....	18

1. Result Area 1:.....	18
2. Result Area 2:.....	20
3. Results Area 3:.....	20
2. Verification Protocols.....	21
3. Reporting Requirements and Deliverables (Tentative)	38
4. Team of Experts Required.....	38
5. Responsibility of the Firm	38
6. Quality Assurance and Professionalism	39
7. Period of Assignment	39
8. Method of Selection.....	39
Section 3: Evaluation Criteria	40
A. Shortlisting.....	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Annexure A: Format for Power of Attorney.....	42
Annexure B: Experience Form	43



**EXPRESSION OF INTEREST
(CONSULTANCY SERVICES-FIRM SELECTION)**

Program Implementation Unit (PIU), Planning & Development Board, Government of Punjab is looking after the monitoring & coordination of key foreign funded programs. For this purpose, PIU invites sealed expression of interest from the eligible firms for the assignment of **“Third Party Validation of Program Development Objectives (PDOs) and Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) for Jobs and Competitiveness (J&C) and Strengthening Markets for Agriculture and Rural Transformation (SMART) Programs”**.

2. Interested firms are required to provide information demonstrating that they have the required qualification and relevant experience to perform the services mentioned above. The firms may associate with other firms in the form of joint venture to enhance their qualifications. The firm for above referred assignment will be selected for the period of three (03) years subject to satisfactory performance in accordance with the Quality and Cost Based Selection (QCBS) method as defined under Punjab Procurement Regulatory Authority (PPRA) rules, 2014.

3. The advertisement and detailed EOI document may be browsed online from websites i.e.; <https://ppra.punjab.gov.pk> and www.piu.punjab.gov.pk and can be obtained from the address below during office hours. EOI proposals must be received by 03:00 PM in our office on or before 25.08.2020.

Ali Jalal
Program Director,
Program Implementation Unit,
Planning & Development Board,
11-A, Upper Mall Scheme, Near Hotel Crown Plaza,
Mian Mir Road, Lahore.
Ph. No. 042-99332566-69
Fax. 042-35750283
Email: pd@piu.punjab.gov.pk

DISCLAIMER

1. The information contained in this Shortlisting document or subsequently provided to Applicant(s), whether verbally or in written form by or on behalf of the Program Implementation Unit, P&D Board (the Client) or any of their employees or advisors, shall be subject to the terms and conditions set out in this shortlisting document and any other terms and conditions subject to which such information is provided.
2. Each Applicant should conduct its own investigations and analysis and should check the accuracy, reliability and completeness of the information in this shortlisting document and obtain independent advice from appropriate sources. The Client, its representatives, their employees and advisors make no representation or warranty and shall incur no liability under any law, statute, rules or regulations as to the accuracy, reliability or completeness of the shortlisting document.
3. The Client may, in their absolute discretion, but without being under any obligation to do so, update, amend, add to any or all of the provisions or supplement the information of this document or cancel the present Expression of Interest (EOI) and call for fresh Invitations under PPRA, 2014. Such changes would be intimated to all Applicants through its website.
4. The Client reserves the right to reject the EOIs submitted in response to this shortlisting document at any stage under PPRA 2014. The Client also reserves the right to hold or withdraw or cancel the process at any stage up to the final shortlisting under PPRA, 2014. The Client may, in its absolute discretion but without being under any obligation to do so, update, amend or supplement the information, assessment or assumptions contained in this document.
5. The issue of this shortlisting document does not imply that the Client is bound to select and shortlist applications for Bid Stage or to appoint the selected Applicant, as the case may be, for the project and the Client reserves the right to reject the Applications with assigning reasons whatsoever under PPRA, 2014.
6. The Applicant shall bear all its costs associated with or relating to the preparation and submission of its Application including but not limited to preparation, copying, postage, delivery fees, expenses associated with any demonstrations or presentations which may be required by the Client or any other costs incurred in connection with or relating to its Application.
7. All such costs and expenses will remain with the Applicant and the Client shall not be liable in any manner whatsoever for the same or for any other costs or other expenses incurred by an Applicant in preparation or submission of the Application, regardless of the conduct or outcome of the process.
8. Neither the Client nor their employees or representative will have any liability in case of non-receipt of any correspondence from them to the Applicants due to the postal delays.
9. Mere submission of Application / EOI or issuance of RFP does not vest any right in the Applicant for being selected for the project.

SECTION I: INSTRUCTION TO APPLICANTS

A. Scope of Application

1. The Client invites Expression of Interests (EOIs) proposals to shortlist experienced and capable Applicants/firms for the Request for Proposals (RFPs) stage through Quality & Cost Based Selection (QCBS) under PPRA, 2014.
2. Shortlisted Applicants would be subsequently invited to submit the technical and financial proposals in respect of the “Third Party Validation of Program Development Objectives (PDOs) and Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) for J&C and SMART Program” under PIU, P&D Board hereinafter referred to as “the TPV of J&C and SMART Programs”.

B. Eligible Applicants

1. A single firm/entity/company or a group of firms/entity/companies (the Joint Venture), coming together to prepare the TPV of J&C and SMART programs. The term Applicant used hereinafter would therefore apply to a single firm/entity and/or an Association. The Joint venture should be meaningful partnership and should have at least one relevant assignment from each firm.
2. The Applicant should submit a Power of Attorney as per the format enclosed at **Annexure-A**, authorizing the signatory of the EOI for submission.
3. Notwithstanding anything stated elsewhere in this document, the Client shall have the right to seek updated information and supplementary information from the Applicant to ensure their continued eligibility. Applicant(s) shall provide evidence of their continued eligibility in a manner that is satisfactory to the Client. Applicant may be disqualified if it is determined by the Client, at any stage of the process, that the Applicant will be unable to fulfil the requirements of the Project or fails to continue to satisfy the Eligibility Criteria.
4. A firm which has been barred or blacklist either by any department /agencies/donors/Ministries of the Government of Pakistan / Punjab or Government departments/agencies of their respective country, in case of Applicant(s) would not be eligible to submit an EOI Application, either individually or as member of a Consortium. Applicant to submit an affidavit to this effect.

C. Number of EOIs

Each Applicant shall submit only one (1) EOI Application, with two (2) copies, in response to this shortlisting document. Any Applicant, which submits or participates in more than one EOI Application will be disqualified and will also cause the disqualification of the J.V of which it is a member as the case may be.

D. EOI Preparation Cost

The Applicant shall be responsible for all of the costs associated with the preparation of its EOI and its participation in the shortlisting process. The Client will not be responsible or in any way liable for such costs, regardless of the conduct or outcome of the shortlisting process.

E. Examination of Shortlisting Document

1. It would be deemed that by submitting the EOI, Applicant has:
 - a. Made a complete and careful examination of the shortlisting document; and
 - b. Received all relevant information requested from the Client.
2. The Client shall not be liable for any mistake or error on the part of the Applicant in respect of the above.

F. Right to Accept or Reject all Applications

1. Notwithstanding anything contained in this shortlisting document, the Client reserves the right to accept or reject EOI and to annul the shortlisting process and reject all EOIs / proposals, at any time without any liability or any obligation for such acceptance, rejection or annulment, under PPRA, 2014.
2. The Client reserves the right to not to shortlist Application if:
 - a. At any time, a material misrepresentation is made or uncovered, or
 - b. The Applicant does not respond promptly and thoroughly to requests for supplemental information required for the evaluation of the EOI.
3. Such misrepresentation / improper response would lead to the disqualification of the Applicant. If the Applicant is a Consortium, then the entire Consortium would be disqualified / rejected.

G. Contents of Shortlisting Document

The Shortlisting Document comprises the contents as given in the Table of Contents and would additionally include any Addenda issued in accordance with the provisions of this Document.

H. Clarifications

Interested parties may address their queries relating to the shortlisting process to the Office of the Client mentioning email and fax number. The queries should reach the above within ten (10) days of publishing of this EOI. The Client would endeavour to respond to the queries. The responses will be sent by fax/ email/courier. The delivery of clarifications to the Applicant shall not be responsibility of the Client. A communication of clarification is considered to be made by the Client if transmittal of fax or email/courier has been made to the Applicant from the Client.

I. Amendment of Shortlisting Document

1. At any time prior to the deadline for submission of EOI Application, the Client may, for any reason, whether at its own initiative or in response to clarifications requested by any Applicant, modify the shortlisting Document by the issuance of an Addendum.
2. Any Addendum thus issued will be sent in writing to all those who have sent queries to the Document, and shall also be uploaded on the website of Client and Punjab Procurement Regulatory Authority.

J. Language

The EOI and all related correspondence and documents should be written in the English language. Supporting documents and printed literature furnished by Applicant with the EOIs should also be in English language.

K. Validity of EOIs

EOIs shall remain valid for a period not less than 120 days from the EOI Application Due Date. The Client reserves the right to reject any EOI Application, which does not meet this requirement.

L. Format and Signing of EOI Application

1. The Applicant would provide all the information as per this shortlisting document. The Client would evaluate only those EOIs that are received in the required format and are complete in all respects.
2. The Applicant shall prepare one original of the documents comprising the EOI Application and clearly marked "ORIGINAL". In addition, the Applicant shall make two copies of the EOI Application, clearly marked "COPY". In the event of any discrepancy between the original and the copies, the original shall prevail.
3. The EOI Application and its copies shall be typed or written in indelible ink and each page shall be initialled and stamped by the Applicant. All the alterations, omissions, additions, or any other amendments made to the EOI Application shall be initialled by the person(s) signing the EOI Application.

M. Sealing and Marking of EOI Applications

1. The Applicant shall seal the original and copy duly marking the envelopes as "ORIGINAL" and "COPY". The envelopes shall then be sealed in an outer envelope super scribing 'EOI TPV J&C and SMART Programs under PIU, P&D Board' and also the name(s) of Applicant / association.
2. The envelope shall be addressed to: "Program Implementation Unit, Planning & Development Board, 11-A, Upper Mall, Mian Meer Road, Near Hotel Crown Plaza, Lahore"
3. If the envelope is not sealed and marked as instructed above, the Client assumes no responsibility for the misplacement or premature opening of the contents of the EOI Application submitted.

N. EOI Application Due Date

EOI Applications should be submitted on or before **August 25, 2020 at 3:00 PM** PST on the Due Date, at the address provided above in the manner and form as detailed in this shortlisting document. EOI Applications submitted by either facsimile transmission, telex or e-mail will not be considered for evaluation and shortlisting. However, the Client reserves the right to extend the EOI Application Due Date and Time, at any time prior to closing/opening of EOIs in response to this shortlisting document. In such cases the EOI applications received prior to such extension shall not be opened. Further, if the document is materially modified during such extended period, the EOI application received prior to extension shall be returned to the Applicants and appropriate time shall be allowed for resubmission of the EOI applications.

O. Late EOI Applications

EOI Applications received after the Due Date and time shall not be considered

P. Modifications/ Substitution/ Withdrawal of EOIs

The Applicant may modify, substitute or withdraw its EOIs after submission, provided that written notice of the modification, substitution or withdrawal is

received by the Client before the EOI's Due Date. No EOI shall be modified or substituted or withdrawn by the Applicant after the EOI Due Date and time.

Q. Evaluation of EOI – Criteria

The Client would subsequently examine and evaluate EOIs in Accordance with the criteria set out in Section 3.

R. Evaluation of EOI - Supporting Documents

The Client reserves the right to call for supporting documentation to verify the data provided by Applicant, at any time during the shortlisting process. The Applicant in such cases would need to provide the requested clarification / documents promptly and within the stipulated time failing which the Applicant is liable to be disqualified at any stage of the shortlisting process.

S. Evaluation of EOI - Right to Reject

The Client reserves the right to reject EOI Application if:

1. At any time, a material misrepresentation is made or uncovered; or
2. The Applicant does not respond promptly and thoroughly to requests for supplemental information required for the evaluation of the EOI.

T. Confidentiality

Information relating to the examination, clarification, evaluation, and recommendation for the short-listed Applicants shall not be disclosed to any person not officially concerned with the process. The Client will treat all information submitted as part of EOI Application in confidence and would require all those who have access to such material to treat the same in confidence. The Client will not divulge any such information unless it is ordered to do so by higher authority that has the power under law to require its disclosure.

U. Clarifications

To facilitate evaluation of EOIs, the Client may at its sole discretion, seek clarifications in writing from any Applicant regarding its EOI or reject the incomplete EOI proposal.

V. Qualification and Notification

After the evaluation of EOIs, the Client would announce a list of shortlisted Applicants who meet the Qualification Criteria. At the same time, the Client would notify other Applicants that their EOI Applications have been unsuccessful. The shortlisted Applicants would then be requested by the Client to submit a detailed Proposal in the form and manner to be set out in the RFP Document.

SECTION 2: TERM OF REFERENCES (TORS)

THIRD PARTY VALIDATION OF PROGRAM DEVELOPMENT OBJECTIVES (PDOs) AND DISBURSEMENT LINKED INDICATORS (DLIs) FOR JOBS AND COMPETITIVENESS (J&C) PROGRAM

• Project Introduction:

Punjab Jobs and Competitiveness (J&C) Program is a World Bank funded five-year program (i.e. FY 2016-17 to FY 2020-2021) with a total funding of USD 100 Million under the Program for Results (PforR) lending instrument and deals with the improvement of governance structures in the province. The program is being monitored by Program Implementation Unit (PIU), P&DD.

• Scope of Work, Duties and Responsibilities:

The Program Key Results and DLIs of Punjab Jobs and Competitiveness Program for Results will be reported to the World Bank on an annual basis by the Government of Pakistan before the 31st of August of each year. Before their submission to the World Bank, these results will have to be verified by a firm competitively recruited by the Government of Punjab (through PIU of P&D). This note outlines the terms of reference for this firm;

- The firm to be recruited through competitive process and should have a reputation to protect. The firm cannot be a respondent to the Doing Business report.
- The contract should cover the PDO indicators, the DLIs as well as progress along the Program Action Plan.

1) Verification of the achievements of the Program Key Results and Disbursement Linked Indicators

- The first Key Result and DLI 1 of the program will be based on the aggregate Doing Business Performance for Punjab (Lahore) across the six selected indicators indexed to the performance of the top performers as reported in the Doing Business 2020 report using the methodology of that same report. This will ensure that Punjab's performance on this indicator will not depend on the future performance of other countries or future changes in the Doing Business methodology.

The Doing Business team sends the governments of all countries included in the Doing Business report a Doing Business reform update early June of every year giving three weeks to the Governments to raise any issues or concerns. The firm will verify the information contained in the Doing Business reform update and will inform the government of any significant issues before the deadline of three weeks. In case of any irreconcilable differences, the point of view of the Doing Business team will prevail. The firm will then estimate the impact of the reforms on Punjab's aggregate Doing Business Performance using the Doing Business 2020 report methodology assuming all else equal (the Doing Business calculator can be found on:

<http://www.doingbusiness.org/data/df-calculator>). Like all other results, the final verification result will have to be communicated to the World Bank by the Government of Pakistan before the 31st of August of each year (the Doing Business report is published in October of each year). See the Doing Business methodology for more details.

- The third and fourth Key Results on employment and investments will be based on information to be provided by PIEDMC and FIEDMC based on surveys of the enterprises operating in their industrial estates. The firm will verify this information by checking the raw data through random sample checks. In case of any irreconcilable differences between the firm and PIEDMC/FIEDMC, the point of view of the firm will prevail.
- DLI2. The Department of Labor will provide the information required to assess the progress made along the reforms of the Labor laws along the nine ILO Conventions. The firm will verify this information, in particular whether adequate consultations of the relevant stakeholders have been performed and their inputs taken into proper consideration. In case of any irreconcilable differences between the firm and the government, the point of view of the firm will prevail.
- DLI3. The significant investment announcements from foreign investors will be monitored by PBIT. The firm will verify this information by checking the raw data, through direct contact with the potential investing firms, to ensure that these announcements do represent a serious intent on behalf of the investors and that they have been targeted and significantly engaged by PBIT – see the precise criteria in the footnote below (taken straight out of the Loan Agreement)¹. In case of any irreconcilable differences between the firm and the government, the point of view of the firm will prevail.
- DLI4. The firm will review the selected infrastructure PC-1s² approved by the Provincial Development Working Party (PDWP) during the fiscal year to ensure that their compliance with the Punjab Spatial Strategy was properly assessed. The initial assessment would have been made by the sponsoring Line Departments and vetted by the Chief Spatial Strategy within P&D before their submission to the PDWP (as specific section to carry out this assessment will be added to the PC-1 template). The number of such projects should be less than one hundred a year – most of them road projects which compliance with the Punjab Spatial Strategy should be relatively easy to assess. The firm will also verify that these investments have been properly vetted by the EPA. During its verification and in case of any doubts, the firm is encouraged to consult with the Chief Strategist of P&D, Urban Unit and/or the expert panel which has been

¹“Investment Announcement” means a public announcement in the form of a press release or similar public notification of the intention of the investor to make a 5 million Dollars capital investment or more in Punjab, appearing in the local or national press or on the investor’s own website or in other publicly accessible media, further to completion of the Program Implementing Entity’s approval process of the proposed investment including, without limitation, clearance from EPA confirming compliance with the Borrower’s and the Program Implementing Entity’s applicable environmental laws and regulations.

² Infrastructure projects in support of growth would be included, including industrial estates on-site and off-site infrastructure, industrial infrastructure outside of industrial estates (e.g. CETPs), infrastructure to support agriculture and livestock markets, inter-city connectivity, and urban expansion projects (e.g. LDA City, M2 New City, Ravi River Development).

set up to assist with the design and implementation of the Punjab Spatial Strategy. The results from this verification will be summarized in a report to be transmitted to the government before the end of July. In case of any irreconcilable differences, the point of view of the firm will prevail.

- DLI5. The PPP Cell will monitor the number of PPP feasibility studies and negotiated PPP contracts presented to the PPP Steering Committee following its quality control. The firm will verify the quality of these feasibility studies and negotiated contracts along international quality benchmarks and as specified in Program Appraisal Document. It will also check that due process has been followed with respect to the PPP competition as set out in the PPP Act. Finally, it will check that consultations of the relevant stakeholders (including the EPA) have taken place and their inputs duly incorporated. In case of any irreconcilable differences between the firm and the government, the point of view of the firm will prevail.
- DLI6. A Steering Committee led by the Department of Industry comprising all relevant stakeholders will supervise the development and implementation of the institutional reforms to improve public support to industrial estates and clusters. The firm will verify the Cluster Development initiative³ as per the criteria laid out in the footnotes (taken straight from the Loan Agreement).

2) Verification Protocols

Each DLI targeted under the J&C Program comes with a set of verifiable and measurable. The following table provides an overview of DLI verification protocols, including variables to be measured and procedure for measurement of said variables.

³ “Cluster Development Initiative” means an in-depth and sustained program of technical assistance focusing on helping companies in industrial clusters, and based on the following principles and criteria: (i) demand driven selection process; (ii) support to firms provided as a public good and/or with contributions from participating firms; (iii) technical assistance procured through international competition; (iv) initiative implemented through a competitively recruited world class team reporting to an independent steering committee established by the Program Implementing Entity’s department of industry and involving interested stakeholders including the private sector; (v) thorough project monitoring and evaluation including an environmental and social assessment consistent with the Borrower’s and the Project Implementing Entity’s applicable environmental and social laws and regulations and the recommendations of Section 7 (Recommendations and Proposed Actions) of the ESSA; and (vi) initiative to entail at least 15 million USD worth of technical assistance over a five year-period.

DLI #	DLI	Definition/ Description of achievement	Protocol to evaluate achievement of the DLI and data/result verification		
			Data source/ agency	Verification Entity	Procedure
1	Aggregate improvement of Punjab's performance with respect to business registration, contract enforcement, construction permits, getting electricity, paying taxes and property registration	Distance to frontier (%) aggregated for business registration, contract enforcement, construction permits, getting electricity, paying taxes and property registration	P&D – PIU	Firm competitively recruited by PIU	Firm to verify the assessment of the Doing Business team before the publication of the Doing Business Report
2	Steps taken to improve compliance with the GSP+ Labor Conventions	Sequence of a) legal gap analysis completed, b) drafting of new relevant Labor laws, c) completion of consultative review and d) submission of revised relevant laws for approval	Labor Department	Same firm	Firm to verify completion of each legal review and reform step, review EU evaluation report before its publication
3	Steps toward the improvement of investment promotion	Announcements for investments of at least US\$5 million from foreign investors generated and facilitated by PBIT	PBIT	Same firm	Firm to collect confirmation from investors
4	Steps toward developing and implementing Punjab Spatial Strategy to prioritize and coordinate public investments	Pre-feasibility study of new city, Spatial Strategy and selected PCI Projects independently reviewed to	P&D	Same firm	Firm to verify the PC-1s and review by the expert panel of the infrastructure projects approved by the PDWP.

		censure consistency with Spatial Strategy			
5	Steps toward the effective development of industrial infrastructure through PPPs	One IE and one CETP feasibility study presented to the PPP Steering Committee following quality control by the PPP Cell Six PPP projects presented to the PPP Steering Committee following quality control by the PPP Cell One CETP operational by Year 5	P&D – PPP Cell	Same firm	Firm to check documentation, interview winning firms and visit the CETP
6	Steps toward designing and implementing a new institutional framework to support industrial estates and clusters	Approval of new institutional setup Operationalization of new institutional setup	DOI, PIED MC, FIED MC, PSIC	Same firm	Firm to verify approval and enactment of key institutional reforms, of hiring, new operational manuals and of launch of technical support projects for industrial clusters

Table 1: Verification protocols

The following table provides an overview of results to be verified as part of program DLIs:

	DLI Baseline December 2015	Indicative timeline for DLI achievement			
		Year or Period 2	Year or Period 3	Year or Period 4	Year or Period 5
DLI 1: Aggregate improvement of Punjab's performance with respect to business registration, contract enforcement, construction permits, getting electricity, paying taxes and property registration	61	–	–	70	75
DLI 2: Steps taken to improve compliance with GSP+ Labor Conventions	–	–	–	New GSP+ compliant Labor laws presented to the Provincial Assembly.	–
DLI 3: Steps toward the improvement of investment promotion	No systematic investor outreach program	–	10 investment announcements by foreign investors	15 investment announcements by foreign investors or any restructuring if approved by Worldbank	15 investment announcements by foreign investors

	DLI Baseline December 2015	Indicative timeline for DLI achievement			
		Year or Period 2	Year or Period 3	Year or Period 4	Year or Period 5
DLI 4: Steps toward developing and implementing the Punjab Spatial Strategy (PSS)	No Provincial Spatial Strategy	–	–	60% of the value of infrastructure PC-1s amounts and all IEs in line with PSS	80% of the value of infrastructure PC-1s amounts and all IEs in line with PSS
DLI 5: Steps toward the effective development of industrial infrastructure through PPPs	No private IEs and no operational CETPs in Punjab	–	–	Two projects presented to PPP SC (IE or CETP)	Two projects presented to PPP SC (IE or CETP); One CETP operational (amount to be allocated through reallocation upon PPP SC approval)
DLI 6: Steps toward designing and implementing a new institutional framework to support industrial estates and clusters	–	Implementation of PSIC restructuring	–	–	–

Table 2: Verification timeline

- **Verification of the implementation of the Program Action Plan**

The Program Action Plan mentioned in Project Approved Document –PAD lists the key activities (legal dated covenants) that the government must undertake to support the realization of DLIs and improvements to related systems to achieve the Program Development Objectives. These activities are all budgeted as part of the PC-1s that the government has prepared for supplementary allocation to the budget based on the gaps identified in the program expenditure review. The firm will verify that the Government of Punjab has implemented the actions listed in the Program Action Plan by the deadlines. The firm will report any delays or issues with the quality of implementation to the PIU which will then inform the World Bank.

THIRD PARTY VALIDATION OF PROGRAM DEVELOPMENT OBJECTIVES (PDOs) AND DISBURSEMENT LINKED INDICATORS (DLIs) FOR STRENGTHENING MARKETS FOR AGRICULTURE AND RURAL TRANSFORMATION (SMART) IN PUNJAB PROGRAM

1. Project Introduction

SMART program is a World Bank funded program being implemented by the Government of Punjab and monitored by Program Implementation Unit (PIU), P&D Board. The total monetary value of the program is estimated at USD 300 Million and the program is expected to be operational from FY19-FY23. The programme is comprised of a range of activities along with specified and time bound targets. In addition to Disbursement Linked Indicators, each of the implementing departments is required to achieve some critical results for the success of the overall SMART Programme. The main objective for the SMART Punjab Program is “to increase the productivity of crop and livestock farmers, improve their climate resilience, and foster agribusiness development in Punjab”.

2. Scope of Work, Duties and Responsibilities

The Program Key Result Areas including Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) and Program Action Plan (PAP) of Strengthening Markets for Agriculture and Rural Transformation in Punjab Program will be reported to the World Bank regularly by the Program Implementing Entity. Before their submission to the World Bank, these results will have to be verified by a firm competitively recruited by the Government of Punjab (through PIU of P&D). This note outlines the terms of reference for this firm.

- The firm will be recruited through competitive process – it should have a reputation to protect.
- The contract should cover the PDO indicators, Intermediate Results, DLIs as well as progress along the Program Action Plan.

1. Verification of the achievements of the Program Key Results and Disbursement Linked Indicators

The program has been divided into three overarching result areas. Broadly, these are:

- 1. Result Area 1:** Increased on-farm productivity and value of crops and livestock.
- 2. Result Area 2:** Increased value and competitiveness of crops and livestock.
- 3. Result Area 3:** Enhanced resilience of smallholder farmers to climate change and natural disasters.

1. Result Area 1:

DLI 1: Improving access to quality farm inputs: Better targeting of subsidies for agricultural inputs to small-scale farmers would increase overall production and would reduce poverty by helping smallholders close the yield gap with larger

producers. This will be done by extending the e-voucher scheme for farmers with holdings smaller than 5 ha.

DLI 2: Revitalizing provincial crop and livestock research and extension systems: A comprehensive, strategically relevant policy for agricultural and livestock research and extension will be designed based on the recommendation of the review of the Punjab Agriculture Innovation System (AIS). Funding for public research would increase (measured as the percentage of AgGDP spent on research), as would the role of the private sector in agricultural research (measured by the composition of the Punjab Agricultural Research Board and the percentage of research grants awarded on a competitive basis). The DLI will also focus on improved coordination between different agencies conducting agriculture research including strengthening links between agriculture extension and research. Additionally, notifications regarding Punjab Agriculture Policy and notifications regarding Punjab Crops and Livestock Research Policy and Strategy will be key for this DLI meeting its targets.

DLI 3(a): Improving livestock health: Resources will shift from curative to preventive animal healthcare (measured by the ratio of expenditures on preventive and curative medicine) to reduce productivity losses to disease. This will require the Livestock and Dairy Development Department to bifurcate expenditures being incurred for curative and preventative medicines.

These interventions are in line with the recommendations of the Performance of Veterinary Services pathway diagnostic for Pakistan undertaken by the World Organization for Animal Health in 2014 (for details see World Bank's Technical Assessment for SMART program, Box 2).

DLI 3(b): Improving livestock breeding: Good breeding stock is essential to improve productivity. This DLI (measured by the number of breeding animals of selected species) will require an incremental number of animals to be registered under a progeny testing program to be conducted by L&DD.

DLI 4(a): Modernizing the wheat marketing system: Modernizing the wheat market would reduce wheat and flour prices and free land for HVA, substantially raising farm incomes and employment. Measured by the official notification that GoPunjab is gradually withdrawing from the wheat market and the subsequent gradual decrease in wheat quantities procured by the GoPunjab, maintaining of a strategic wheat reserve of no more than 2 million MT along with developing bulk storage silos under PPP arrangements.

DLI 4(b): Transitioning to high-value agriculture: This DLI aims to shift current agricultural production towards more profitable and intensive practices through the promotion of High Value Agriculture (HVA). Achievement of this DLI will depend on the percentage of the agriculture allocation in the ADP to High Value Agriculture

(HVA) schemes. An additional measure is approval of the Punjab Agriculture Policy, which is expected to provide further strategic directions for the agriculture sector.

2. Result Area 2:

DLI 5: Providing incentives to agribusinesses for investment in value addition and agricultural technology: SMART Punjab will support an Agribusiness and Innovation Fund to be set up by Go-Punjab. An operational manual will be setup for the Agribusiness and Innovation fund, in order to guide the fund's operations. The fund will award matching grants, with particular consideration for women and young people, on a competitive basis and measured by the specific number of grants awarded.

DLI 6: Improving market conditions for meat and raw milk: Removing meat and raw milk price caps (measured by the discontinuation of notification of meat and milk prices) would stimulate production and marketing of better quality and safer livestock products, raising producers' incomes and increasing supplies for urban areas

DLI 7: Modernizing agricultural markets: Reforming wholesale market legislation to allow greater private sector participation and enhance transparency (measured by approval and notification of the Punjab Agricultural Marketing Regulatory Authority Act) would reduce the margins taken by middlemen, reduce the government's role in controlling these markets, allow the private sector to set up markets and provide farmers with alternatives markets.

DLI 8: Improving food safety: Better food and agricultural standards, backed by testing and enforcement mechanisms, would improve the quality of food products and public health, and address concerns about contaminated or adulterated products. Measured by tracking progress in establishing and operationalizing a provincial food testing reference laboratory, regional laboratories, and divisional mobile laboratories.

3. Results Area 3:

DLI 9: Improving sustainability and efficiency of irrigation: More equitable access to water and better assessment and collection of *Abiana* would encourage producers to use water more efficiently with no increases in overall water use, and increase funds for M&R. Adoption of a provincial water policy and groundwater Act are important first steps toward addressing the overexploitation of water, falling groundwater tables, and increasing salinization. Measured by approval of the Punjab Water Policy, notification of the Punjab Groundwater Act, improvements in the area assessed for *Abiana*, tracking *Abiana* collection rates, and tracking water delivery performance ratios (defined as actual amount of water delivered divided by amount delivered according to canal design, measured at different points along the canal) in selected canals. This will improve water delivery equity among users of irrigation water.

The DLI also envisages the demarcation of critical groundwater areas in the province followed by publishing of groundwater zoning and map. This is to be followed by geo-referencing and registration of all tube-wells operating in the province.

DLI 10: Rolling-out an agricultural insurance system: Crop insurance can help crop producers stabilize incomes and sustain resilience when natural events deplete harvests. A feasibility report detailing a suitable crop insurance scheme was completed in July 2017. A five-year work plan will be developed based on the crop-insurance scheme, followed by a pilot program in at least two districts in the province starting April 2018, and further roll out to other districts in subsequent years.

DLI 11: Increasing public investment in climate-smart agriculture: Enhancing public investment in CSA would help farmers adopt new technologies and approaches and reduce potential losses related to climate change. Measured by tracking the percentage of the total allocation for agriculture in the ADP towards CSA schemes.

DLI 12: Communications, beneficiary feedback, capacity building, and monitoring and evaluation: A substantial communications strategy (including a beneficiary feedback protocol) and capacity-building program will mobilize support for agricultural and rural transformation among stakeholders into the future. Strengthening monitoring and evaluation (M&E) capacity in participating departments will facilitate progress monitoring. Measured by development and implementation of a communications strategy and annual capacity development plans.

2. Verification Protocols

Each DLI targeted under the SMART Punjab Program comes with a set of verifiable and measurable indicators. The following table provides an overview of DLI verification protocols, including variables to be measured and procedure for measurement of said variables:

DLI No	DLI title	Definition/description of achievement	Protocol to evaluate achievement of the DLI and data/result verification	
			Data source/ agency	Procedure
1	Improving access to quality farm inputs	E-voucher system for agricultural inputs in place and reaching targeted farmers.	Agriculture Department	- Ag. Department to maintain records of farmers provided with E-vouchers for agricultural inputs

				<p>subsidy with unique numbers and provide this information to WB.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Firm to verify records and conduct random authentication.
2	<p>Revitalizing provincial crop and livestock research and extension systems</p>	<p>Sequence of: (a) agricultural and livestock research and extension strategy and policy developed and approved, in line with recommendations of World Bank review and including (i) review of the current structure, conduct and performance of the Punjab agricultural research and extension (R&E) system, (ii) recommendations regarding restructuring of the Punjab agriculture R&E system and redefining its mandate, and (iii) recommendations regarding organizational structure including role of private sector; (b) Punjab Agricultural Research Board Act 1997 amended, including reconstitution of Board with majority of members from private</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - MTDF^a - Punjab Budget - Civil Accounts - Agriculture, Livestock & Dairy Development, Finance, P&D Departments 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Ag. Department to communicate approved Crops and Livestock Research and Extension Policy - Ag. Department to provide Gazette notification of Punjab Agricultural Research Board (PARB) Act amendment and reconstitution of its Board of Directors. - Ag. Department and Livestock & Dairy Development Department to notify WB of final allocations at the beginning of each FY (July) - Firm to verify approved allocations, spending against approved allocations and all of above.

		sector and revised operational procedures in line with recommendations of World Bank review; (c) increased allocation to research (ADP & Recurrent) expressed as a percentage of AgGDP and spending against allocation; and (d) resource allocation for competitive grants.		
3 (a)	Improving livestock health	Heads of account for preventive and curative care separated in the recurrent budget Gradual reallocation of resources from curative care to preventive care until 90% of the budget is apportioned to preventive care.	- Livestock & Dairy Development, Finance Departments - Punjab Budget Civil Accounts	- Firm to verify separation of heads of account in the budget, annual allocation and spending.
3 (b)	Improving livestock breeding	Progress in registering Sahiwal cow, Neeli Ravi buffalo, and Cholistani cow in progeny testing program.	Livestock & Dairy Development Department	- Livestock & Dairy Development Department to maintain ICT based database for each species and notify WB of progress in registration of animals in progeny testing program. - Firm to verify registration records.
4 (a)	Modernizing the wheat marketing system	GoPunjab plan for withdrawal from official wheat procurement program in 2018 and gradual	Food, Finance Departments	- Food Department to notify public and WB of phasing out of official

		<p>downscaling of wheat strategic reserve to not more than 2 million MT by <i>rabi</i> 2021 approved.</p>	<p>wheat procurement system and reducing wheat reserve to not more than 2 million MT by <i>rabi</i> 2021.</p> <p>- Firm to (a) verify documentary evidence that GoPunjab has formulated and disseminated policy to phase out official wheat procurement system, (b) verify Food Department records regarding quantities of wheat procured, (c) verify that GoPunjab has phased out its wheat procurement program in which farmers can offer their wheat to government procurement centres, and (d) verify that arrangements have been developed for bulk storage facilities for 2 million MT under public-private partnership.</p>
--	--	---	--

4 (b)	Transitioning to high-value agriculture	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Increased percentage points of ADP allocation for agriculture invested in helping farmers transition from traditional crops to HVA - Increased area under HVA. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - MTDF - Punjab Budget Civil Accounts - Agriculture, P&D Departments - Crop Reporting Service (Agriculture Department) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Ag. Department to notify WB of final allocations at the beginning of each FY (July). - Firm to verify approved allocations and spending - Firm to verify area under HVA.
5	Providing incentives to agribusinesses for investments in value addition and agricultural technology	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Total amount of funds (in US\$) awarded every year as matching grants to agribusinesses. 	Agriculture Department	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Financial progress reports submitted to WB on agreed template each quarter. - Firm to review documentation of grants awarded and conduct interviews with awardees.
6	Improving market conditions for meat and raw milk	Price caps on meat and milk prices removed (GoPunjab discontinues official notification of prices).	Livestock & Dairy Development, and Industries, Commerce & Investment Departments	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Departments of Livestock & Dairy Development, and Industries, Commerce & Investment to notify WB of decision of GoPunjab each year. - Firm to verify discontinuation of price notifications at provincial and district levels.

8	Improving food safety	Progress in establishing and operationalizing, regional labs, divisional labs, mobile labs.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Food, Agriculture, P&D Department s - PAFDA - PFA - MTFD - Punjab Budget Civil Accounts 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - PFSA and Food Department to notify WB of establishment and operationalization of regional, divisional, and mobile labs. - Firm to verify PC-Is of the relevant schemes, corresponding resource allocations in the budget, and operationalization of laboratories.
9	Improving sustainability and efficiency of irrigation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -Progress in ensuring sustainability of irrigation systems, technically (Punjab Water Policy and Punjab Groundwater Act) and financially (water charges or <i>Abiana</i> assessment improved and collection increased), delivery performance ratio (DPR) improved in command areas of 6 canals. -Approval and notification of Punjab water Act that (a) establishes Integrated Water Resources Commission with the power and responsibility to prepare and implement policies and plans for the sustainable use and management of water resources, (b) requires the demarcation of “critical areas” of 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Irrigation, Finance Departments - Punjab Board of Revenue - MTFD - Punjab Budget Civil Accounts 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Irrigation Department to share data regarding improvements in <i>Abiana</i> assessment and collection duly verified by Finance Department and Board of Revenue. - Notification and map of critical areas of groundwater and data of existing tube wells. - Firm to verify <i>Abiana</i> collection rate, and groundwater critical areas map and database.

		<p>groundwater over-extraction, (c) requires the registration of existing tube wells, (d) requires a permitting process to be established for any new tube wells, and (e) establishes and enforces a licensing regime for tube well drillers.</p> <p>-Approval and notification of Punjab Water Policy with clear policy directions on the sustainable use, management and development of water from all sources, for all sub-sectors across the entire province, to halt or reverse environmental and water resource degradation, while maintaining beneficial uses of water that support socioeconomic outcomes, and specifying appropriate and realistic key policy actions for five priority areas: (a) water governance, (b) water allocation, (c) water quantity and water-related disaster management, (d) water quality management, and (e) water management outside irrigation command areas.</p>		
--	--	--	--	--

10	Rolling-out an agricultural insurance system	Steps towards rolling out an agricultural insurance system include (d) rolling out to all districts.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Agriculture, Livestock & Dairy Development, P&D, Finance Departments - MTDF - Punjab Budget Civil Accounts 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Resource allocation by P&D/Finance Departments. - Agriculture Department to provide financial progress reports to WB each quarter. - Firm to validate the above and collect information from insurance firms, survey.
11	Increasing public investment in climate-smart agriculture	Increased percentage of ADP allocation for agriculture invested in climate-smart agriculture technologies.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Agriculture, P&D Departments - MTDF - Punjab Budget Civil Accounts 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Agriculture Department to notify WB of final allocations at the beginning of each FY (July) for CSA and spending against that allocation. - Firm to verify approved allocations and spending.
12	Communications, beneficiary feedback, capacity building, and monitoring and evaluation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Communications strategy developed and implemented; beneficiary feedback obtained; annual plans for capacity-building in agribusiness and institutional strengthening of implementing departments, and other government organization developed and implemented. - ICT-based monitoring and evaluation (M&E) system developed in 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - P&D, Agriculture, Livestock & Dairy Development, Food, Irrigation Departments - MTDF - Punjab Budget Civil Accounts 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Annual capacity-building plans that include specification of types of trainings offered, and numbers of participants to be trained. - Resource allocation for capacity building, training, and ICT based M&E. - Firm to verify.

		key implementing departments.		
--	--	-------------------------------	--	--

The following table provides an overview of results to be verified as part of program DLIs:

DLI	Baseline	Prior Results	Indicative Timeline for DLI Achievement			
			Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	Year 5
DLI 1 - Improving access to quality farm inputs	No E-voucher system in place	Department of Agriculture (DoAg) has extended the coverage of E-vouchers providing subsidies for agricultural inputs to at least 25,000 farmers with less than 5 ha of farm land in FY17.	-	-	DoAg has extended the coverage of E-vouchers providing subsidies for agricultural inputs to at least 200,000 farmers with less than 5 ha of farm land in FY21.	-

<p>DLI 2 - Revitalizing provincial crop and livestock research and extension systems</p>	<p>0.1% of AgGDP allocated to research in FY16/17 of which 4% allocated to competitive research grants.</p>		<p>(a) Punjab's Cabinet has approved and notified in the Gazette a new Agriculture and Livestock Research and Extension Policy (b) Punjab's Assembly has amended (as notified in the Gazette) the Punjab Agricultural Research Board Act (1997), to reconstitute the Board with a majority of professionals from related fields in the private sector, and to revise its mandate in line with the Review Team Report (c) (i) Punjab's Assembly has approved</p>	<p>i) Punjab's Assembly has approved aggregate budgetary allocations for agriculture and/or livestock research for FY20 equivalent to 0.25% of Punjab's AgGDP, of which 12% has been channelled through competitive research grants, including to the private sector; and (ii) DoAg. and DoL&DD have spent at least 70% of the FY20 allocated resources.</p>	<p>i) Punjab's Assembly has approved aggregate budgetary allocations for agriculture and/or livestock research for FY21 equivalent to 0.3% of Punjab's AgGDP, of which 16% has been channelled through competitive research grants, including to the private sector; and (ii) DoAg. and DoL&DD have spent at least 80% of the FY21 allocated resources.</p>	<p>(i) Punjab's Assembly has approved aggregate budgetary allocations for agriculture and/or livestock research for FY22 equivalent to 0.4% of Punjab's AgGDP, of which 20% has been channelled through competitive research grants, including to the private sector; and (ii) DoAg. and DoL&DD have spent at least 80% of the FY22 allocated resources.</p>
---	---	--	---	--	---	--

			<p>aggregate budgetary allocations for agriculture and/or livestock research for FY19 equivalent to 0.2% of Punjab's AgGDP, of which 8% has been channeled through competitive research grants, including to the private sector; and (ii) DoAg. and DoL&DD have spent at least 60% of the FY19 allocated budgetary resources.</p>			
DLI 3 (a) - Improving livestock health	Preventive to curative ratio 65:35 in FY17 under the same head of account in the budget.		-	DoL&DD's budgetary allocations for FY21 for preventive vs. curative animal healthcare have	-	DoL&DD's budgetary allocations for FY23 for preventive vs. curative animal healthcare have

				achieved a 4:1 ratio.		achieved a 9:1 ratio.
DLI 3 (b) - Improving livestock breeding	7,000 animals registered in progeny testing program of Sahiwal cow, Neeli Ravi buffalo, and Cholistani cow.		-	DoL&DD has registered at least 22,000 animals in its progeny testing program for Sahiwal cow, Nili-Ravi buffalo, and Cholistani cow.	-	DoL&DD has registered at least 30,000 animals in its progeny testing program for Sahiwal cow, Nili-Ravi buffalo, and Cholistani cow.
DLI4 (b) - Modernizing the wheat marketing system	Punjab Agriculture Policy under preparation 3.5% of agriculture Annual Development Plan (ADP) allocated for FY17 to high-value agriculture (HVA).	Punjab's Assembly has allocated at least 6% of the amounts budgeted for DoAg. under the ADP for FY18 towards HVA.	-	i) Punjab's Assembly has allocated at least 12% of the amount budgeted for DoAg. under the ADP for FY21 towards HVA; and (ii) DoAg. has spent at least 80% of the FY20 allocated budgetary resources.	(i) Punjab's Assembly has allocated at least 14% of the amount budgeted for DoAg. under the ADP for FY22 towards HVA; and (ii) DoAg. has spent at least 80% of the FY21 allocated budgetary resources.	(i) Punjab's Assembly has allocated at least 15% of the amount budgeted for DoAg. under the ADP for FY23 towards HVA; and (ii) DoAg. has spent at least 80% of the FY22 allocated budgetary resources.

<p>DLI 5 - Providing incentives to agribusinesses for investments in value addition and agricultural technology</p>	<p>No matching grants in ADP.</p>		<p>The Agribusiness and Innovation Fund has awarded at least 20 Matching Grants to agribusinesses, of which at least 4 have been awarded to women or young adults in FY19.</p>	<p>The Agribusiness and Innovation Fund has awarded at least 50 Matching Grants to agribusinesses, of which at least 15 have been awarded to women or young adults in FY20.</p>	<p>The Agribusiness and Innovation Fund has awarded at least 70 Matching Grants to agribusinesses, of which at least 28 have been awarded to women or young adults in FY21.</p>	<p>The Agribusiness and Innovation Fund has awarded at least 100 Matching Grants to agribusinesses, of which at least 50 have been awarded to women or young adults in FY22.</p>
<p>DLI 6 - Improving market conditions for meat and raw milk</p>	<p>Prices of meat and raw milk are on the list of Essential Commodities subject to price caps.</p>		<p>Punjab has publicly announced and implemented market based pricing for meat and raw milk in FY19.</p>	<p>-</p>	<p>-</p>	<p>Punjab has implemented market-based pricing for meat and raw milk in FY20 through FY22.</p>
<p>DLI 8 - Improving food safety</p>	<p>No food testing laboratories.</p>		<p>-</p>	<p>Department of Food (DoF) has established and operationalized one (1) regional food testing lab and two (2) divisional mobile foods testing</p>	<p>DoF has established and operationalized a second regional food testing lab and three (3) divisional mobile foods testing</p>	<p>DoF has established and operationalized a third regional food testing lab and four (4) divisional mobile foods testing labs, additional</p>

				labs, all in accordance with the ISO/IEC 17025:2005 standard.	labs, additional to those of Year 3, all in accordance with the ISO/IEC 17025:2005 standard.	to those of Years 3 and 4, all in accordance with the ISO/IEC 17025:2005 standard.
DLI 9 - Improving sustainability and efficiency of irrigation	<p>Punjab Water Policy and Ground Water Act under preparation.</p> <p>Abiana assessment = Pakistani Rupee (PKR) 1 billion in FY16/17, of which 61% is collected.</p> <p>Equity of water distribution in accordance with entitlements with delivery performance ratio of 0.70.</p>		-	<p>(a) PID has: (i) demarcated the critical groundwater areas of Punjab; and (ii) notified and published the groundwater zoning and map thereof;</p> <p>(b) PID has increased the <i>Abiana</i> collection in FY20 to reach 80% of the improved assessment; and</p> <p>(c) PID has improved the equity of water distribution in selected canals in accordance</p>	<p>(a) PID has: (i) established an electronic geo-referenced database for tube wells; and (ii) registered all existing tube wells in Punjab including their geographical coordinates; and</p> <p>(b) PID has increased the <i>Abiana</i> collection in FY21 to reach 85% of the improved assessment.</p>	<p>PID has increased the <i>Abiana</i> collection in FY22 to reach 90% of the improved assessment.</p>

				with entitlements, with a delivery performance ratio of 0.85 in FY20.		
DLI 10 - Rolling-out an agricultural insurance system	Crop loan insurance scheme is mandatory for all seasonal crop credit borrowers – but protects lenders, not farmers.	DoAg. has approved the Diagnostic Report assessing the crop loan insurance scheme and analysing options for an agricultural insurance coverage.	-	-	DoAg. has implemented an agricultural insurance scheme in districts additional to those covered in FY18 though FY20, with an insurance take-up reaching 750,000 policies sold in FY21.	DoAg. has implemented an agricultural insurance scheme in districts additional to those covered in FY18 though FY21, with an insurance take-up reaching 1,000,000 policies sold in FY22.
DLI 11 - Increasing public investment in climate-smart agriculture	3% of allocation for agriculture in FY17 ADP for climate-smart agriculture (CSA). 50% of total allocation for agriculture spent.	Punjab's Assembly has allocated at least 6% of the amount budgeted for agriculture under the ADP for FY18 to	-	(a) Punjab's Assembly has allocated at least 12% of the amount budgeted for agriculture under the ADP for FY21 to investments in	(a) Punjab's Assembly has allocated at least 14% of the amount budgeted for agriculture under the ADP for FY22 to investments in	a) Punjab's Assembly has allocated at least 15% of the amount budgeted for agriculture under the ADP for FY23 to investments in

		investments in CSA.		CSA; and (b) DoAg. has spent at least 80% of the resources allocated therefor in FY20.	CSA; and (b) DoAg. has spent at least 80% of the resources allocated therefor in FY21.	CSA; and (b) DoAg. spent at least 80% of the resources allocated therefor in FY22.
DLI 12 - Communications, beneficiary feedback, capacity building, and monitoring and evaluation	Technical assistance provided during Program preparation including series of policy notes, assessment of communications capacity, review of agricultural research and extension.		-	The participating departments have prepared and implemented the FY20 annual capacity building plan, in a manner and substance acceptable to the Bank.	The participating departments have prepared and implemented the FY21 annual capacity building plan, in a manner and substance acceptable to the Bank.	The participating departments have prepared and implemented the FY22 annual capacity building plan, in a manner and substance acceptable to the Bank.

Table 3: Verification timeline

3. Reporting Requirements and Deliverables (Tentative)

The firm will be expected to deliver the following assignments on the given tentative schedule:

Sr. No.	Report	Delivery Time Period
1.	Inception Report	15-days after commencement of services
2.	First Draft Report	45 days after submission of Inception Report.
3.	Final Report	30 days after submission of draft report.

4. Team of Experts Required

Sr. No	Description	# of Seats	Eligibility Criteria
1	Team Leader	1	CA/ACCA/CFA, Masters' Degree in Business Administration/ Project Management/ Economics/ Public Policy/ Finance, M. Com or related discipline with Minimum 10 Years of relevant experience.
2	Quality Control Manager/ Expert	2	CA/ACCA/CFA, Masters' in Business Administration/ Economics/ Project Management, M. Com or related field with minimum 5 years' experience in relevant field
3	Field Supervisor	7	Bachelor Degree in relevant discipline with minimum 3 years' experience in relevant field

5. Responsibility of the Firm

The firm will have full, free and unrestricted access to the project's records, physical properties, personnel and other entities relevant to an area under review. The firm will have no responsibility for or authority over any of the activities or operations subject to its review.

The firm shall not perform any operational duties, develop and install systems and procedures, prepare records, or engage in any other activity which it would normally review and appraise and which could reasonably be construed to compromise in appearance or fact, the independence and/or objectivity of the firm.

6. Quality Assurance and Professionalism

The Firm shall ensure that all work conforms to the highest professional and quality standards. Any issues with quality will result in penalties being charged to the firm.

7. Period of Assignment

The duration of the assignment is three (03) years subject to satisfactory performance. The firm is expected to deploy its resources for 3-4 months for each year. 9-12 person months depending upon input of each expert spread over 36 calendar months.

8. Method of Selection

Selection of the firm will be based on Quality and Cost Based (QCBS) as defined in PPRA Rules 2014.

SECTION 3: EVALUATION CRITERIA

SHORTLISTING CRITERIA

The minimum qualifying marks is 65

Sr. No.	Criteria	Marks
1	General	
1.1	a. Legal status of firm (registration with registrar of firm or SECP etc). b. registration with relevant professional body i.e institute of Chartered accounts of Pakistan (ICAP).Duly renewed for for the year 2020 C. Must have ranking of State Bank of Pakistan (A category)	Mandatory Criteria
1.2	Registration with Federal Board of Revenue FBR (NTN Certificate and with Punjab Revenue Authority PRA (PRA registration certificate)	Mandatory Criteria
1.3	Declaration on stamp paper regarding non black listing/delisting of applicant and all of its practice in Pakistan	Mandatory Criteria

Sr. No	Criteria	Max. Marks	
1.	Financial Position Average turnover of at least 20 million in last three financial year supported with FY 2016-17, 2017-18, 2018-19 annual financial statements	10	a. Turnover from 10 million to 20 Million =05 Marks b. Turnover from 21 million to 40 Million=07 Marks c. Turnover from 41 Million and above=10 Marks
2.	Managerial Capability List of partners attached with ICAP registration numbers and date of admission.	10	Upto 5 Partners = 02makrs 6-10 partners = 05 marks More than 11 partners = 10 Marks

3.	ICAP qualified chartered accounts employed by the firm in Pakistan excluding partners (attached list with ICAP registration numbers, department and location)	10	Up to 10 qualified CAs = 05 Marks Upto 11-20 ICAP qualified CAs = 07 Marks More than 20 ICAP qualified CAs =10 Marks
4.	Experience: Completion of similar donor funded assignments duly supported with documentary evidence i.e; completion certificates / contract agreement/work orders etc.)	50	3-5 Completed Projects = 35 Marks 6-7 Completed Projects = 40 Marks 8 and above Completed Projects = 50 Marks
5.	Firm's General Experience since incorporation	20	5-7 years = 10 Marks 8-10 years = 15 Marks More than 10 years = 20 Marks

ANNEXURE-A: FORMAT FOR POWER OF ATTORNEY

(On a Notary / Stamp Paper of Appropriate Value)

Know all men by these presents, we _____ (name and address of the registered office) do hereby constitute, appoint and authorize Mr./Ms. _____ (name and address of residence) who is presently employed with us and holding the position of _____ as our attorney, to do in our name and on our behalf, all such acts, deeds and things necessary in connection with or incidental to our EOI for the Development of Punjab Spatial Strategy, including signing and submission of all documents and providing information/ responses to Urban Sector Planning and Management Services Unit (Pvt) Limited, representing us in all matters and generally dealing in all matters in connection with our proposal for the said project.

We hereby agree to ratify all such acts, deeds and things lawfully done by our said attorney pursuant to this Power of Attorney and that all such acts, deeds and things awfully done by our aforesaid attorney shall and shall always be deemed to have been done by us.

**For -----
(Signature)
(Name, Title and Address)
Applicant seal & stamp**

Important Notes:

- 1. To be executed by all members of the Consortium duly supported .by a Board Resolution*
- 2. The mode of execution of the Power of Attorney should be in accordance with the procedure, if any, laid down by the applicable law and the charter documents of the executants (s) and when it is so required the same should be under common seal affixed in accordance with the required procedure.*
- 3. Also, where required, the executants(s) should submit for verification the extract of the charter documents and documents such as a resolution / power of attorney in favour of the Person executing this Power of Attorney for the delegation of power hereunder on behalf of the Applicant.*

ANNEXURE B: EXPERIENCE FORM

[Using the format below, provide information on each project for which you, and each associate for this project, was legally contracted as a corporate entity or as one of the major members within a consortium, for carrying out project similar to the ones requested under this Project. Use maximum 20 pages. Please provide Client's certification and/or evidence of the contract agreement.]

Project name:	Value of the agreement (in current PKR):
Country: Location within country:	Duration of project (months):
Name of Client:	Total No. of staff-months (by your company) on the project:
Start date (month/year): Completion date (month/year):	Value of total project provided under an agreement (in current PKR) In case of consortium, value of part of the project provided by Applicant under the agreement (in current PKR):
Name of associated members, if any:	No. of professional staff-months provided by associated members:
Name of senior professional staff of your company involved and functions performed (indicate most significant profiles such as Team Leader, Urban Economist etc):	
Narrative description of Project:	
Description of actual services provided by your staff within the assignment:	

Note:

- 1. Only the eligible projects that satisfy technical criteria shall be included.*
- 2. All the Financial numbers are to be given in Pak Rupees*
- 3. The format shall be filled up for each member of the consortium and as a cumulative experience for the consortium*

(Signature of Authorized Signatory)

Applicant seal & stamp _