

**Program Support Unit (PSU),
Punjab Resource Improvement and Digital
Effectiveness (PRIDE) Program
Planning & Development Board,
Government of the Punjab**



SHORTLITING REPORT

**REQUEST FOR EXPRESSION
OF INTEREST (REOI)**

**Hiring of Consultancy Firm for Impact
Assessment of Interventions under PRIDE
Program**

Ref# PK-PSU-317772-CS-QCBS

**Program Support Unit, Planning & Development Board,
Vogue Towers, 5th Floor, Block C-2 Gulberg-III, Lahore
Ph# 042-99332566-69, Fax # 042-3575028**

1. PROGRAM BACKGROUND

Planning & Development Board in collaboration with World Bank Group is implementing Punjab Resource Improvement and Digital Effectiveness (PRIDE). It is a five-year program funded by the World Bank Group with objective to strengthen Public Financial Management (PFM) Systems and revenue mobilization in the Punjab Province. For this purpose, a Program Implementation Unit shall oversee the monitoring & coordination of this program under Technical Assistance Component. PIU, P&D Board under Program Support Unit, P&D Board intends to apply part of the funds to cover eligible payments under the Contract **Hiring of Consultancy Firm for Impact Assessment of Interventions under PRIDE Program**. Since the estimated cost is **USD=300,000/-**, therefore, the procurement is processed through Quality & Cost Based Selection (QCBS) method in accordance with World Bank's Procurement Regulation as per approved procurement plan.

2. SHORTLISTING PROCESS

I. REQUEST FOR EXPRESSION OF INTERESTS (REOIS)

The Request for Expression of Interest (REOI) was published in **daily newspapers** "Dawn" and "Dunya" on November 07, 2022 and also uploaded on the websites of PIU, PPRA and STEP portal on November 07, 2022. (**Appendix-1**). Following interested firms participated in the procurement process:

- i) M/s. A.F.Ferguson & Co. (PWC)
- ii) M/s. IConsult (Lead Firm) Rehman Habib – OTIUM (Consortia)
- iii) M/s. Centre for Economic Research (CERP)
- iv) M/s. Apex Consulting Pakistan
- v) M/s. GAT Consulting
- vi) M/s. UHY Hassan Naeem & Co.
- vii) M/s. ASB (IPSOS)
- viii) M/s. Nauman Javed Hasnain Rashid (NJHR) C.A.
- ix) M/s. Social Entrepreneurship Equity Development (SEED) Ventures
- x) M/s. SKAFS (Lead Firm) - TAGM - BESTEL (Consortia)
- xi) M/s. FINCON Services (Lead) & NESPAK (Joint Venture)

ii. SUBMISSION OF EOI

The date and time for submission of EOI was fixed on **23.11.2022** at **04:00 P.M** and EOI from above mentioned Eleven (11) firms were received on the fixed date and time:



iii. SHORTLISTING CRITERIA

The Consultant Selection Committee (CSC) evaluated the Expression of Interests (EOIs) on the basis of following parameters as mentioned in the Request for Expression of Interest (REOIs)

- i. Demonstrable capacity to understand and evaluate the impact of interventions of projects / programs initiatives of government or donor funded.
- ii. Should have completed at least three (3) similar assignments (Copies of verifiable of similar nature of contracts with copies of notification of award and/or contracts and full address and contact information of the employer).
- iii. Minimum average annual turnover required for the last two years is Rs. 10 Million.
- iv. Availability of technically qualified staff alongwith organizational structure (brief description is required).
- v. Letter of incorporation of firm.

iv. SHORLISTED FIRMS:

Sr. #	Name of Firm	Reasons for Shortlisting
01	A.F.Ferguson	<p>A.F.Ferguson & Co. has provided its incorporation certificate showing that the firm is in business since 1969 and Demonstrable capacity to understand the assignment. According to the audited reports of A.F. Ferguson the average annual turnover for the last two years is Rs 5,095.0 Million which is higher than the required criteria of Rs 10 million. Similarly, the consultant has required technically qualified staff to execute the assignment. The following three similar assignments of the consultant are considered for evaluation which are the most relevant to the TORs:</p> <p>1. Project Name: Doing Business Measures Regulations Affecting 11 Areas of the Life of a Business Name of Client: World Bank Country: Pakistan Similar Experience: Contributing to annual doing business reports of World Bank For a number of years, AFF has been a respondent to world Bank and providing key information relating to ease of doing business in Pakistan. Doing Business measures regulations affecting 11 areas of the life of a business such as, starting a business, dealing with construction permits, getting electricity, registering property, getting credit, protecting minority investors, paying taxes, trading across borders, enforcing contracts and resolving insolvency.</p> <p>2. Project Name: The Fiduciary Risk Assessment Name of Client: Aga Khan Planning and Building Services, Pakistan (USAID)</p>



		<p>Country: Pakistan</p> <p>Similar Experience: The fiduciary risk assessment was conducted using the Non-US Pre-Award Survey (NUPAS) checklist developed by USAID. The assessment was performed for segment fiduciary risk areas i.e; Legal Structure, Financial Management and Internal Controls Systems, Procurement Systems, Human Resources System, Program Performance Management, Organizational Sustainability</p> <p>3. Project Name: Organizational assessments of six SDC's partners</p> <p>Name of Client: Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation (SDC)</p> <p>Country: Pakistan</p> <p>Similar Experience: AFF has carried out procurement review, grant audit, Fact finding review and risk assessment of implementing partners of SDC Organizational assessments of six SDC's partners were conducted in two phases, South Asia Partnership Pakistan, Community Appraisal & Motivation Program, Agha Khan Rural Support Program, Inter cooperation (Pakistan); PAK Community Development Program; and Danish Refugee Council.</p> <p>Conclusion: The consultant has fulfilled the requirement of shortlisting criteria specified in the REOI, such as Demonstrable capacity to understand, have completed 3 similar assignment, meet the requirement of 10.00 M turn over and have technical qualified staff as per REOI. Hence, the Consultant is recommended for shortlisting</p>
02	Centre for Economic Research in Pakistan (CERP)	<p>CERP has provided its incorporation certificate showing that the firm is in business since 2007 and Demonstrable capacity to understand the assignment. According to the audited reports of CERP the average annual turnover for the last two years is Rs 117.24 which is higher than the required criteria of Rs 10 million. Similarly, the consultant has required technically qualified staff to execute the assignment. The following three similar assignments of the consultant are considered for evaluation which are the most relevant to the TORs:</p> <p>1. Project Name: Evaluation and Impact Assessment of Punjab Economic Opportunities Program (PEOP)</p> <p>Name of Client: GOP</p> <p>Country: Pakistan</p> <p>Similar Experience: In 2010, the Government of Punjab collaborated with DFID in four districts of Southern Punjab to help alleviate poverty and vulnerability. PEOP was implemented by PSDF with focus on increasing employability and earnings of low income, poor and vulnerable families by augmenting their technical and vocational skills.</p>



		<p>2. Project Name: Asset Transfer Program Name of Client: The Government of Punjab Country: Pakistan Similar Experience: The projects main aim was to evaluate the effectiveness of asset and cash transfers, hence providing policy recommendations towards designing the best social safety net which can improve income of the ultra - poor belonging to four districts of Punjab, Pakistan.</p> <p>3. Project Name: Social Impact: Urban Services and Taxes Name of Client: GOP Country: Pakistan Similar Experience: This project evaluated a series of reforms that strengthen the link between the provision of local services and local property tax collection i urban Pakistan. This project aims to increase the link between taxes paid and local services received by enabling citizens to better and more credibly express their preferences for types of local urban services and to link the provision of these services with the amount of local taxes paid.</p> <p>Conclusion: The consultant has fulfilled the requirement of shortlisting criteria specified in the REOI, such as Demonstrable capacity to understand, have completed 3 similar assignments, meet the requirement of 10 M turn over and have technical qualified staff as per REOI. Hence, the Consultant is recommended for shortlisting</p>
03	ASB (IPSOS)	<p>ASB (IPSOS) has provided its incorporation certificate showing that the firm is in business since 2012 and Demonstrable capacity to understand the assignment. According to the audited reports of ASB the average annual turnover for the last two years is Rs 334.00 Million which is higher than the required criteria of Rs 10 million. Similarly, the consultant has required technically qualified staff to execute the assignment. The following three similar assignments of the consultant are considered for evaluation which are the most relevant to the TORs:</p> <p>1. Project Name: End-line survey on perception, usage and attitudes towards family planning. Name of Client: Greenstar Country: Pakistan Similar Experience: Monitoring and Evaluation of the whole survey, which took place in Southern Punjab, Northern Sindh, KPK and FATA.</p> <p>2. Project Name: Baseline survey to understand potential of technological intervention to improve family planning. Name of Client: PPIF Country: Pakistan Similar Experience: Monitoring and Evaluation of the entire survey in Rawalpindi and Muzaffargarh.</p>

		<p>3. Project Name: Assessment of the impact of public and development outreach campaign and communication activities.</p> <p>Name of Client: Management Systems International (MSI)</p> <p>Country: Pakistan</p> <p>Similar Experience: The objective of the assignment was to conduct Sample Finalization, Questionnaire Development, Pre - testing, Fieldwork, Data Coding, Data Processing, Data Analysis and Report writing.</p> <p>Conclusion: The consultant has fulfilled the requirement of shortlisting criteria specified in the REOI, such as Demonstrable capacity to understand, have completed 3 similar assignments, meet the requirement of 10 M turn over and have technical qualified staff as per REOI. Hence, the Consultant is recommended for shortlisting</p>
04	GAT Consulting	<p>GAT Consulting has provided its incorporation certificate showing that the firm is in business since 2014 and Demonstrable capacity to understand the assignment. According to the audited reports of GAT consulting the average annual turnover for the last two years is Rs 20.1 which is higher than the required criteria of Rs 10 million. Similarly, the consultant has required technically qualified staff to execute the assignment. The following three similar assignments of the consultant are considered for evaluation which are the most relevant to the TORs:</p> <p>1. Name of Project: Impact Assessment of 4 CRIs of Cluster Development Initiative (CDI) Project Client: PSIC - CDI Date: February - March 2022</p> <p>Similar Experience: Impact assessment of 4 initiatives undertaken by Punjab Small Industries Corporation under UNIDO related to the Readymade Garments, Auto Parts, Surgical Instruments and Leather Footwear design centers set up in Lahore.</p> <p>2. Name of Project: Ehsaas Nashonuma Operational Review Client: Benazir Income Support Programme (BISP) Date: September 2021 - July 2022</p> <p>Similar Experience: The Ehsaas Nashonuma programme is an initiative of the Benazir Income Support Program (BISP) that aims at providing conditional cash transfers to pregnant and lactating women who are already BISP beneficiaries.</p> <p>3. Name of Project: Baseline Survey of ECE classes in Government Schools Client: PMIU - PHCIP Date: August 2021 - January 2022</p>

		<p>Similar Experience: Baseline survey of ECE classrooms, teachers, parents, caregivers in 11 districts of primarily southern Punjab. The Punjab Capital Investment Project of the World Bank. Content will be developed based on the outcomes of this study to align with the Single National Curriculum.</p> <p>Conclusion: The consultant has fulfilled the requirement of shortlisting criteria specified in the REOI, such as Demonstrable capacity to understand, have completed 3 similar assignments, meet the requirement of 10 M turn over and have technical qualified staff as per REOI.</p>
05	APEX Consulting Pakistan	<p>APEX Consulting Pakistan has provided its incorporation certificate showing that the firm is in business since 2020 and Demonstrable capacity to understand the assignment. According to the audited reports of APEX the average annual turnover for the last two years is Rs 73.91 which is higher than the required criteria of Rs 10 million. Similarly, the consultant has required technically qualified staff to execute the assignment. The following three similar assignments of the consultant are considered for evaluation which are the most relevant to the TORs:</p> <p>1. Project Name: Socioeconomic Baseline Survey in Sindh for NRSP Name of Client: National Rural Support Program (NRSP) Country: Pakistan Similar Experience: With European Unions financial support, the provincial government launched the Sindh Union Council and Community Economic Strengthening Support (SUCCESS) Programme in eight poor rural districts in Sindh in 2015. Data on socioeconomic profiling was collected through Computer Assisted Personal Interviews (CAPI). Key indicators of data collection were household demographics, health, farm and non - farm income, livestock, savings, loan, assets, nutrition, vaccination and access and use of public services.</p> <p>2. Project Name: Impact Assessment Survey of RSPs Community Physical Infrastructure Projects. Name of Client: National Rural Support Programme (NRSP) Country: Pakistan Similar Experience: The objective of this survey was to assess the immediate impact of community Physical Infrastructure Projects (CPIs) implemented by the RSPs. The survey provided the decision makers with information to help improve the design and implementation of the community infrastructure projects.</p> <p>3. Project Name: Pre and post intervention of survey of drugs awareness in KPK Name of Client: KPK</p>



	<p>Country: Pakistan</p> <p>Similar Experience: Pre intervention survey in six target cities was conducted to obtain a baseline of knowledge, attitude and practices to various population groups including general public, youth, parents, teachers, women, religious leaders to assess the impact and to raise knowledge, information about harmful effects of drugs and ways to prevent drug use.</p> <p>Conclusion: The consultant has fulfilled the requirement of shortlisting criteria specified in the REOI, such as Demonstrable capacity to understand, have completed 3 similar assignments, meet the requirement of 10 M turn over and have technical qualified staff as per REOI. Hence, the Consultant is recommended for shortlisting</p>
06	<p>i-Consult (Lead Firm) - Rehman Habib - OTIUM (Consortia)</p> <p>IConsult has provided its incorporation certificate showing that the firm is in business since 2014 and Demonstrable capacity to understand the assignment. According to the audited reports of Consultant the average annual turnover for the last two years is Rs 119.91 Million which is higher than the required criteria of Rs 10 million. Similarly, the consultant has required technically qualified staff to execute the assignment. The following three similar assignments of the consultant are considered for evaluation which are the most relevant to the TORs:</p> <p>1. Name of Project: Impact assessment for DLIs 1-2 for the "Access to Clean Energy Investment Program" and Independent Validation of Solarization of 10861 Schools and Energy Audit of 150 Buildings Client: Project Management Unit, Energy Department, Punjab</p> <p>Similar Experience: To perform base line verifications and confirmation of Compliance with PAP Actions and to evaluate the results in terms of gender indicators, performance audits focusing on internal control, under the M&E Team.</p> <p>2. Name of Project: Third Party Verification of community Driven Local Development Policy (CDLD) Program in 12 Districts of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Client: European Union and Government of Kp Date: 2018-2021</p> <p>Similar Experience: The Technical Assistance company for the CDLD programme, Hulla & Co Human Dynamics KG Austria, had engaged, Grant Thornton Consulting (Pvt.) Limited as Monitoring and Evaluation Experts, DLI's Verification Agent, Financial Management Experts to undertake the continuous Monitoring, Verification and Evaluation in the form of a third party verification of the use of the CDLD funds and verify assets contracted to be created by the CDLD projects.</p>

		<p>3. Name of Project: Project Assessment - Innovation Challenge Fund (ICF) Round 1 Client: Karandaaz Pakistan Date: Sep 16 2020 - Feb 28 2021 Similar Experience: The impact assessment undertaken by iConsult entailed: Karandaaz process review; market research of the IR ecosystem of Pakistan and similar economies; the impact of remittance DFS products, funded under ICF, on the overall volume of IR in Pakistan and shift to DFS to conventional methods. Conclusion: The consultant has fulfilled the requirement of shortlisting criteria specified in the REOI, such as Demonstrable capacity to understand, have completed 3 similar assignments, meet the requirement of 10 M turn over and have technical qualified staff as per REOI. Hence, the Consultant is recommended for shortlisting</p>
7	UHY Hassan Naeem & Co.	<p>UHY Hassan Naeem & Co. has provided its incorporation certificate showing that the firm is in business since 2006 and Demonstrable capacity to understand the assignment. According to the audited reports of Consultant the average annual turnover for the last two years is Rs 175.3 Million which is higher than the required criteria of Rs 10 million. Similarly, the consultant has required technically qualified staff to execute the assignment. The following three similar assignments of the consultant are considered for evaluation which are the most relevant to the TORs:</p> <p>1. Name of Project: Third Party Survey and Validation of the Govt Project for cancer patients in Punjab Project under the MOUs signed between Govt. of Punjab and Novartis Pharma Client: Specialized Healthcare and Medical Education Department Government of Punjab Pakistan Similar Experience: The project's socio-economic impact was assessed together with the treatment's effect on patient survival rates.</p> <p>2. Name of Project: Study of Impact & Third Party Survey and Validation of Enhanced HIV/AIDS Prevention & Control Program, Punjab Client: Primary and Secondary Healthcare Department, Govt. of Punjab Pakistan Similar Experience: Validation of adopted procedures/ Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs) for different activities and the level of adherence through interviews, surveys, examination of data, documents, and survey to evaluate the impact on operations and safety of workers.</p>



		<p>3. Name of Project: Third Party Evaluation and Validation of Infection Control Program, DGHS Punjab</p> <p>Client: Primary and Secondary Healthcare Department, Govt. of Punjab Pakistan</p> <p>Research was conducted regarding best practices internationally and developed an inception report based on the terms of reference and after initial consultations with stakeholders, which included: options appraisal of methodology and approach, work plan, timelines and key deliverables.</p> <p>Conclusion: The consultant has fulfilled the requirement of shortlisting criteria specified in the REOI, such as Demonstrable capacity to understand, have completed 3 similar assignments, meet the requirement of 10 M turn over and have technical qualified staff as per REOI. Hence, the Consultant is recommended for shortlisting</p>
--	--	--

V. NOT SHORTLISTED FIRMS

Sr. #	Name of Firm	Reasons for Rejection
01	Nauman Javed Hasnain Rashid (NJHR) C.A.	The consultant has provided the details of similar projects completed which pertains to feasibility study and not relevant to this assignment. Hence the consultant is not recommended for shortlisting.
02	Social Entrepreneurship Equity Development (SEED) Ventures	The consultant has provided the details of similar projects completed which are not relevant to this assignment. Hence the consultant is not recommended for shortlisting.
03	FINCON Services (Lead) & NESPAK (Joint Venture)	The details of similar projects provided by both Joint Venture (JV) Partners either do not fulfill the requirements as per the criteria, and not relevant to this assignment. Hence the consultant (JV) is not recommended for shortlisting.
04	SKAFS (Lead Firm) - TAGM - BESTEL (Consortia)	The consultant has provided the details of similar projects completed which pertains to MIS Sector, GIS Sector, and Infrastructure Sector (Building, Water Supply, Sanitation, Road), and are irrelevant to this assignment. Hence the consultant is not recommended for shortlisting

vi. RECOMMENDATION

- a. The Consultant Selection Committee (CSC), based on the Criteria, shortlisted Seven (07) consulting firms out of Eleven (11) EOIs received.
- b. The Consultant Selection Committee (CSC) reviewed and approved the RFP Document.
- c. The Consultant Selection Committee (CSC) recommended issuing RFP Document to the Seven (07) Shortlisted firms.



(Mr. Ali Faisal)
Procurement Specialist, PSU



(Mr. Shahid Mahmood Adil)
Public Sector Specialist
(Co-opted member)



(Mr. Zia Ullah Khan)
Superintendent (P&D) Finance
Department



(Mr. Naveed Iqbal)
Assistant Chief, P&D Board



(Mr. Hafeez Aziz)
Financial Management Specialist

(Mr. Ali Jalal)
Program Director, PIU/PSU
P&D Board



**PROGRAM IMPLEMENTATION UNIT
PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT BOARD
GOVERNMENT OF THE PUNJAB**

**Request for Expression of Interest (REOI)
Hiring of consulting firm for Program
Impact Assessment of Interventions
under PRIDE Program**

Country: Pakistan
Project: Punjab Resource Improvement and Digital Effectiveness (PRIDE)
Credit No: 9170-PK
Reference# PK-PSU-317772-CS-QCBS
Assignment Title: Program Impact Assessment of Interventions under PRIDE Program
Duration: 3-Years (extendable)
Contract Type: Lumpsum

Government of Punjab, the Program Implementation Unit, Planning and Development Board, under the Technical Assistance (TA) component of Punjab Resource Improvement and Digital Effectiveness (PRIDE) program intends to hire eligible firm for "Program Impact Assessment" of Interventions under PRIDE Program. For this purpose, eligible consulting firms or association of firms (in joint venture) are invited to participate in the shortlisting process.

Interested Consultants (firms) should provide information demonstrating that they have the required qualifications and relevant experience to perform the subject services.

Shortlisting Criteria:

- i. Demonstrable capacity to understand and evaluate the impact of interventions of projects / programs initiatives of government or donor funded.
- ii. Should have completed at least three (3) similar assignments (Copies of verifiable of similar nature of contracts with copies of notification of award and/or contracts and full address and contact information of the employer).
- iii. Minimum average annual turnover required for the last two years is Rs. 10 Million.
- iv. Availability of technically qualified staff along with organizational structure (brief description is required).
- v. Letter of incorporation of firm.

Interested firms must provide information indicating that they are qualified to perform the services (brochures, description of similar assignments, experience in similar conditions, availability of appropriate skills among staff, etc.).

The attention of interested Consultants is drawn to the World Bank Procurement Regulation for IPF Borrower for Selection and Employment of Consultants on conflict of interest.

Consultants may associate with other firms to enhance their qualifications but should indicate clearly whether the association is in the form of a joint venture or consortia. In the case of a joint venture, all the partners in the joint venture shall be jointly and severally liable for the entire contract, if selected.

Firm will be selected in accordance with the Quality & Cost Based Selection (QCBS) method set out in the World Bank's Procurement Regulation July 2016 (Revised November 2017 and August 2018).

Terms of Reference (TORs) for the assignment can be downloaded from the website: <https://piu.punjab.gov.pk/> or can also be obtained at the address given below during office hours (0900 to 1700). Expressions of Interest (EOI) may be delivered in written form to the address given below on or before November 23, 2022 (4:00 PM).

Program Director

Program Implementation Unit Planning & Development Board
11-A, Upper Mall Scheme Mian Meer Road, Lahore

Ph. No. 042-99332566-69 Fax. 042-35750283 www.piu.punjab.gov.pk
(LHR-G) IPL-11342